

## **EXHIBIT P**



# Nowhere to Swim:

## The Disparate Impact of Town of Islip Pool Closures on Working-Class Communities of Color

**An analysis of what communities will be most affected  
by pool closings**

A report by New York Communities for Change  
1090 Suffolk Ave.  
Brentwood NY 11717  
(631) 881-4804  
byoung@nycommunities.org  
[www.nycommunities.org](http://www.nycommunities.org)  
Issued March 2013

## **Introduction**

This report uses demographic information to show that the proposed closure of either of the two public pools serving Central Islip, Brentwood, and North Bay Shore (Roberto Clemente and Casamento Parks), among others would disproportionately impact lower income neighborhoods with high concentrations of people of color. By allowing these factors to determine their decision, the Islip Town Council is setting a precedent of racist and classist policy-making that will further disenfranchise the already struggling communities they represent.

## **Background Information**

- On Tuesday, Jan. 29<sup>th</sup>, the town of Islip's board of trustees voted to close two of five public pools as a result of budget cuts.<sup>1</sup>
- The two pools slated for closure are located at Roberto Clemente Park in Brentwood, and Casamento Park in West Islip, but also serve residents in Central Islip, Brentwood, North Bay Shore and other communities.
- "Speakers ranging from longtime northern Islip residents and community activists to a representative from New York state Assemblyman Phil Ramos' office spoke against the closure at Tuesday's town board meeting and complained that the public wasn't informed. Bay Shore resident Mary Reid said residents would only have known had they read the finalized budget closely."<sup>2</sup>
- "Supervisor Tom Croci said the pools are temporarily closed in part because the town is short on cash to implement much-needed repairs." We had assigned some capital money for that, but unfortunately due to the hurricane [Sandy], when we went through the budget we had to put those monies into repairs," he said, adding that federal officials have not yet reimbursed the town for storm expenditures."<sup>3</sup>
- After widespread criticism from residents following the initial decision on Jan. 29<sup>th</sup>, the Islip Board of Trustees announced on March 5<sup>th</sup> the possibility of reopening one of the pools this summer.
- "There's no guarantee either pool will reopen this summer, Councilman Anthony Senft said, but he added that he is optimistic. Senft said town officials are particularly focused on reopening Roberto Clemente Park pool because it serves a more isolated area that's farther away from the town's other six pools."<sup>4</sup>

### **Pool Closure Impact on Residential Access**

- Councilman Anthony Senft said residents would be encouraged to use the towns three other pools, in Hauppauge, Bay Shore and Oakdale. But Brentwood Association of Concerned Citizens co-founder Lenny Tucker said that's not viable for many families.<sup>5</sup>
- The pool at Roberto Clemente Park is equidistant from the respective centers of Brentwood, North Bay Shore, and Central Islip, which is a short commute via public transportation for many residents. Of the four other swimming facilities in the area, it is the most centrally located.
- The two pools at Casamento Park are similarly situated to serve the communities of West Islip, North Bay Shore, Brentwood, and others.
- Senft's suggestion that residents use the town's other pools ("Hauppauge, Bay Shore and Oakdale") is impractical.
  1. Hauppauge is eight miles from Roberto Clemente Park, and twelve miles from Casamento, and is not served by public transportation. Residents without a private vehicle would be unable to easily access these facilities.
  2. Byron Lake Park ('Oakdale') presents a similar problem, in that it is eight miles from Roberto Clemente Park, and ten miles from Casamento. Reaching it from the area of Roberto Clemente Park via public transport requires numerous transfers, making the trip prohibitive for those without a private vehicle.
  3. Currently, there is no public pool in Bay Shore. Councilmen Senft was likely referring to Shipwreck Cove Spray Park, located at the Bay Shore Marina. The attraction is not free, and requires either a membership, or payment of entrance fee to use. And, as with Byron Lake Park, the commute via public transport is arduous, especially for residents of areas in which pools are closing.
- Offloading demand for swimming facilities onto these three pools will create an issue of congestion, and access. In closing the other two pools, the Town Council is not only compelling residents to travel farther in order to swim. They are also providing minority populations in Brentwood, Central Islip, and North Bay Shore with fewer swimming areas, meaning those remaining open will be overcrowded, furthering restricting access for some who might otherwise use them.

### **Neighborhoods Affected by Pool Closures**

(Areas containing or served by a public pool slated for closure)

- The neighborhoods served by the two pools selected for closure are predominantly occupied by black and Hispanic/Latino populations: 77.1% in Central Islip, 84.9% in Brentwood, and 83.3% of North Bay Shore.
- Median household income in these three neighborhoods is significantly lower on average than the areas in the following section.
- Councilman Senft's claim that these neighborhoods are somehow 'isolated' is not supported by the population data. Central Islip and Brentwood each have more residents than any of the areas in which swimming facilities remain open.

### **Neighborhoods Unaffected by Pool Closures**

(Areas containing, or served by a public pool not slated for closure)

- The three swimming facilities ("Hauppauge, Bay Shore and Oakdale") suggested by Councilman Senft are all located in towns with a majority white population and, with the exception of Bay Shore, a significantly higher household income.
- Other neighborhoods served by these facilities ("Hauppauge, Bay Shore and Oakdale") like Bohemia or Islip (West and East, as well), show a similar demographic disparity when compared with areas in which pools are closing.
- Overall, this disparity shows that the poorest and least white of the neighborhoods in Islip stand to be deprived of their swimming facilities, while those with a majority white population and a higher household income will not.

### **Conclusion**

In order to ensure that currently disenfranchised Islip populations are not further marginalized, the Islip Town Council must be held accountable for concealing a measure clearly based on cutting services to minority areas while hiding beneath the guise of "fiscal necessity." Councilmen Senft's characterization of the neighborhoods served by Roberto Clemente as 'isolated areas' further makes the point that the Councilman sees these communities as separate from the rest of the town . If this sort of policy is allowed to progress without censure, further measures based on similar prejudice will become the standard when

addressing budgetary concerns, and these communities will continue to suffer. In practical terms, the board's decision will limit access to, and congest, public swimming facilities, and greatly impact the overall quality of life for all residents of Islip.

**New York Communities for Change**: is a coalition of working families in low and moderate income communities fighting for social and economic justice throughout New York State. By using direct action, legislative advocacy, and community organizing, NY Communities' members work to impact the political and economic policies that directly affect us. Through neighborhood chapters and issue-based committees, we are working to ensure that every family throughout New York has access to quality schools, affordable housing, and good jobs.

**Appendix****Demographic Data For Areas Affected by the Pool Closure****Central Islip<sup>6</sup>**

Total population: 34,450

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$70,310

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	43.6%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	25.0%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.9%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	3.4%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	5.9%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	52.1%

**Brentwood<sup>7</sup>**

Total population: 60,664

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$70,816

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	48.4%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	16.4%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.2%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	2.0%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	5.7%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	68.5%

**North Bay Shore<sup>8</sup>**

Total population: 18,944

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$68,596

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	43.6%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	18.3%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.7%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	3.8%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	6.1%

Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b) 65.0%

### **Demographic Data for Communities unaffected by Pool Closure**

#### **Hauppauge<sup>9</sup>**

Total population: 20,882

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$104,285

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	89.2%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	2.2%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.1%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	5.9%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	1.3%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	7.1%

#### **Oakdale<sup>10</sup>**

Total population: 7,974

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$91,667

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	96.5%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.2%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.3%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	0.7%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	3.9%

#### **Bay Shore<sup>11</sup>**

Total population: 26,337

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$67,832

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	61.0%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	19.6%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.7%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	3.2%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010	Z



(a)	
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	4.2%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	30.8%

**Islip<sup>12</sup>**

Population total: 18,689

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$90,772

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	86.4%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	4.7%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.2%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	2.5%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	0.1%
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	2.3%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	13.8%

**East Islip<sup>13</sup>**

Population total: 14,475

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$97,901

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	94.5%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.0%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.1%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.6%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	0.0%
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	1.4%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	6.2%

**West Islip<sup>14</sup>**

Population total: 28,335

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$99,343

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	95.9%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.6%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.7%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	1.1%

Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b) 5.5%

**Bohemia<sup>15</sup>**

Total population: 10,180

Median household income, 2007-2011: \$97,606

White persons, percent, 2010 (a)	93.9%
Black persons, percent, 2010 (a)	1.0%
American Indian and Alaska Native persons, percent, 2010 (a)	0.1%
Asian persons, percent, 2010 (a)	2.3%
Native Hawaiian and Other Pacific Islander, percent, 2010 (a)	Z
Persons reporting two or more races, percent, 2010	1.4%
Persons of Hispanic or Latino origin, percent, 2010 (b)	7.1%

**Notes:**

---

<sup>1</sup> Ruud. "Islip Residents Wade in on Pool Closures." Newsday. Jan. 29<sup>th</sup>, 2013. Online edition.)

<sup>2</sup> Ibid.

<sup>3</sup> Ibid.

<sup>4</sup> Ruud. "Officials aim to open one Islip Town pool by summer." Newsday. March 5<sup>th</sup>. Online edition.

<sup>5</sup> Ruud, "Islip Residents . . ."

<sup>6</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3613552.html>

<sup>7</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3608026.html>

<sup>8</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3651495.html>

<sup>9</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3632732.html>

<sup>10</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3654144.html>

<sup>11</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3604935.html>

<sup>12</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3637869.html>

<sup>13</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3622315.html>

<sup>14</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3680302.html>

<sup>15</sup> <http://quickfacts.census.gov/qfd/states/36/3607157.html>